

# Impediment on Primary Schools and Teachers from Human Capital Utilization: A Conceptual Study of the Learning Process with Gender Discrimination Perspective

MOMINAH TARIQ

Research Scholar

Karachi University Business School, University of Karachi, Pakistan

DR. SOHAIB-UZ-ZAMAN

Assistant Professor

Karachi University Business School, University of Karachi, Pakistan

Received: Dec. 19, 2021 Accepted: Jan. 20, 2022 Online published: Feb. 13, 2022

doi:10.5296/ijhrs.v12i1.19546

URL: <https://doi.org/10.5296/ijhrs.v12i1.19546>

## Abstract

Pakistan is a developing state with an extreme need to provide primary students with the greatest available educational opportunities. The purpose of this research was to discover that female teachers are more beneficial for primary students because of their nurturing and caring nature. Also, the impact of HR practices i.e., Job satisfaction on the commitment of teaching with gender discrimination perspective. The study was conducted among a Pakistan, sample drawn from Karachi. An online survey was conducted from government and private sector schools in Pakistan. 205 teachers of various districts of Karachi, Pakistan was randomly selected, irrespective of gender, age, work experience and dispensed with a questionnaire. Chi-square test analysis was used because gender is a categorical variable. The result of the study reveals that a female teacher is more committed to the teaching profession. Also, primary students are more comfortable with the female teacher due to the nurturing, caring, and loving nature of this gender. Female teachers are more satisfied with the schooling job and enjoyed it. On the other hand, male teachers are less satisfied with school jobs due to many reasons like less pay, a monotonous work routine, etc. Hence, we accepted all the hypotheses of a study.

**Keywords:** HR practices, Job satisfaction, Gender, Commitment to the teaching profession, Female teachers.

## 1. Introduction

Everyone understands that education can make or break a country (Kiran, 2019). Any country's education sector plays a critical role in its development. Pakistani specialists are emphasizing the importance of the education sector since they know that investing in education will benefit any country (Sial et al., 2011). Teachers are the foundation of the school system. Human resources should take care of similar to the other resources, in the form of monetary, non-monetary, technology intensification, etc. in the school (Bhakuni et al., 2020).

Human resource management should be regarded as designing the different systems in a school that guarantee the efficient and effective use of human skills to obtain the school goals (Bhakuni et al., 2020). HRM performs a key role in the retention of effective and efficient teachers within schools to obtain satisfactory student outcomes (Loeb et al., 2012).

Although studies are inconclusive, gender was identified as one of the preliminary dedications for teaching. In many countries teaching profession is facing a low commitment level among teachers. Gender traits could be an essential factor in what type of personality is attracted to teaching. For instance, Female teachers were shown high commitment and a positive attitude for the teaching profession in contrast with male teachers (Ingersoll et al. 1997). Stereotypical gender roles explain both masculine and feminine identity traits, like independence, aggressive, low patience, insensitiveness, apathy, and monotask ability belongs to the masculine traits, whereas submissive, unaggressive, high patience, empathy, nurturing, sensitivity, and multitasking belongs to the feminine traits (Moses et al., 2016). The main goal of human resource management practice in this field is to boost the enthusiasm of teachers and endeavor for students to achieve the maximum possible accomplishments (Runhaar, 2016).

Several studies have found that human characteristics (e.g., age, gender, capability, academic background, qualification, certification), working environment, school environment, managerial cooperation, prior learning, and professional experience all influence commitment to teaching (Billingsley, 2004).

All over the world, commitment to the teaching profession is broadly examined because of its importance in a variety of facets of education. Students' intentions to pursue a teaching career, as well as work satisfaction and retention, have been demonstrated to be influenced by a commitment to teaching (Rots et al., 2010). (Billingsley, 2004; Day et al., 2005; Hackett et al., 2001; Klassen and Chiu, 2011; Tait, 2008). The commitment of teachers was also found as a significant factor influencing motivation and schoolchildren's performance (Reyes, 1990; Rosenholtz, 1989).

“In an education sector, there is a common opinion that female instructors are more effective than male teachers in primary schools,” he told. Psychologically,” A child felt more comfortable with female teachers as compared to male teachers”, said Imran Takkar, a child

activist. Moreover, female teachers' roles are remarkable within the field of education as compared to male teachers (Ashfaq, 2017). The capabilities of the country's schools and teachers, as well as crucial external and internal elements that aid in the implementation of school aims, impact the country's characteristics. The climate in which schools function, as well as the satisfaction of the teachers who work there, have a significant impact on their performance and long-term viability (Rani & Rani, 2014).

## **2. Literature Review**

### *2.1 Commitment to the Teaching Profession*

According to Guarino et al. (2006) study research on a commitment to the teaching profession based upon gender shows indecisive outcomes which demonstrate that female teachers' commitment, optimistic attitude towards the teaching profession is higher than the male teachers. If an organization wants to increase employee commitment, it must facilitate the employee to obtain these goals. On the other hand, organizational commitment decreases if the organization is not delivering adequate opportunities (Sial et al., 2011). Particularly, HRM can improve teacher performance, and, as a result, student results, by boosting teachers' competence and dedication (Runhaar, 2016).

### *2.2 Gender Stereotype Profession*

According to gender stereotypes, teaching is considered a feminized occupation that associates primary school teaching relates a mother's nourishing role, nurturing affection, empathy, sensitivity (Moses et al., 2016). Typically, a woman's "purpose" and "duty" in her "divine nature" by a "right contribution in society" is considered to be teaching (Kelleher, 2011). Women are always responsible for young children's education (Drudy, 2008).

Fischman's research shows that teaching is a strongly gendered profession, with political, social, cultural, economic, and recognized aspects extending from typically bad working standards and insufficient pay to stereotypes, describing teaching as a female-dominated profession. (Fischman 2007). The frequent reason for the low ratio of male teachers in primary teaching was that the concept regarding primary teaching is a women's job which connects with the mother's role and her duty elucidate by both school students and its teachers. The most significant reason given by pupils was that they thought basic education was uninteresting — that it was monotonous, inconvenient, unpleasant, or required too much patience. Low salary is frequently identified as the main cause for the lack of male teachers. The decline in male primary school teachers is explained by a change in perspective that the perfect primary school teacher is a woman, established on the stereotypical assumption that a female's characteristics make children's personalities better (Drudy, 2008). Teaching, which protects the child, his or her needs and desires, and aids to his or her wellness, is another manifestation of caring as a "basic female feature." The (female) teacher's job is to respect the freedom, inventiveness, and spontaneity of the student (Noddings, 2015).

### *2.3 HR Practices*

The present working environment focuses on an organization's resource-based vision, as all

firms perceive human resources as assets and develop them to gain a competitive edge, for example (Barney,1991; Barney et.al, 2001). HR strategies help companies develop capable personnel, empower them to find opportunities in the outside world, and become more responsive than their competitors (Wright et. al, 2001). Now we'll talk about the HR practice (job satisfaction) that was chosen for this study and its impact on teaching commitment.

#### *2.4 Job Satisfaction*

According to school dynamics, teacher job satisfaction is another important aspect and is judged as the main reliant factor when evaluating an organization's human resource success. A satisfied teacher contributes to the upliftment of society, but an unsatisfied teacher might become impatient and generate rigidity, influencing the students' learning process and, as a result, their academic advancement. A satisfied teacher may make a big difference in the lives of his or her students. The work environment has been shown to have a substantial impact on job satisfaction (Rani & Rani, 2014).

#### *2.5 Hypothesis*

H<sub>1</sub>= Female teachers are more beneficial for the primary schooling system.

H<sub>2</sub>= Female teachers are more committed to the teaching profession.

H<sub>3</sub> = There is a significant relationship between job satisfaction and the gender of teachers in the teaching profession.

### **3. Research Methodology**

A random selection of different schools (including govt. and private) were made from the city of Karachi for the research described in the paper shown in (Table 1). A random sample of 205 teachers from numerous schools participated. The given sample consists of respondents from different districts of Karachi including both genders of different age groups, qualifications, current employment status, work experience categories working at various schools. The given sample easily represents the population. The paper's population involved primary teachers of both govt. and private schools of Karachi. A questionnaire consists of 28 items. It was divided into three aspects. The first part deals with the demographic information provided by the respondents (8 items). The second section was aimed at collecting data about job satisfaction (5 items). The third section is associated with the commitment to the teaching profession (15 items).

The response was measured using a Likert scale, a total of five points ranging from "Strongly Disagree=1" to "Strongly Agree=5". The 'commitment to teaching profession' Questionnaire developed by (Moses et al., 2016) and (Bogler, 2001) 'teacher's satisfaction' was utilized. The demographic component of the questionnaire has nine items, including a school district, gender, age group, qualification, current employment status, and work experience, among others.

Table 1. Demographic Statistics (N=205)

<b>Respondents Profile Statistics (N=205)</b>				
<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Demographics</b>	<b>Sub-Categories</b>	<b>Number of Respondents</b>	<b>%</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>School's District</b>	Karachi East District	40	19%
		Karachi Central District	98	48%
		Karachi South District	13	6%
		Karachi West District	16	8%
		Malir District	16	8%
		Korangi District	12	6%
		Kemari District	10	5%
<b>2</b>	<b>Gender</b>	Female	114	56%
		Male	91	44%
<b>3</b>	<b>Age Group</b>	Below 21 years	11	6%
		21-30 years	97	47%
		31-40 years	50	24%
		41-50 years	39	19%
		Above 50 years	8	4%
<b>4</b>	<b>Highest Qualification</b>	Matric degree	0	0%
		Intermediate degree	30	14%
		Bachelor's degree	108	53%
		Master's degree/ M.Phil.	67	33%
		Doctorate/ Ph.D.	0	0%
<b>5</b>	<b>Current Employment Status</b>	Permanent employee	154	75%
		Non-permanent employee	51	25%
<b>6</b>	<b>Work Experience</b>	1-5 years	94	46%
		6-10 years	47	23%
		11-15 years	16	8%
		16-20 years	26	13%
		21-25 years	13	6%
		Above 25 years	9	4%

Table 2. Chi-Square test analysis (N=205)

Chi-Square Tests						
		Value	df	Asymp. Sig. (2-sided)	Level of significance	Result
H <sub>1</sub>	Pearson Chi-Square	56.303	10	0.000	0.05	Accepted
	Likelihood Ratio	70.796	10	0.000		
	Linear-by-Linear Association	16.869	1	0.000		
	N of Valid Cases	205				
H <sub>2</sub>	Pearson Chi-Square	71.441	1	0.000	0.05	Accepted
	Likelihood Ratio	38.901	1	0.000		
	Linear-by-Linear Association	4.082	1	0.000		
	N of Valid Cases	205				
H <sub>3</sub>	Pearson Chi-Square	33.080	10	0.000	0.05	Accepted
	Likelihood Ratio	37.575	10	0.000		
	Linear-by-Linear Association	1.115	1	0.001		
	N of Valid Cases	205				

\* Cronbach alpha =.89

#### 4. Analysis

Table 1 depicts the demographic section in its entirety. The data was collected from government and private sector primary schools in Karachi, indicating that the sample represented the entire population. The gender part of the table shows that 68 % of the respondents were female and 32 % were male. The school's district portion reflects that 19%, 48%, 6%, 8%, 8%, 6%, 5% data were collected from Karachi East District, Karachi Central Districts, Karachi South District, Karachi West District, Malir District, Korangi District, Kemari District respectively. The table demonstrates that the data covered all aspects of the population and accurately represented the population.

Table 2 shows the chi-square analysis for the study variables. The Cronbach alpha for all variables was more than 0.60 as Nunnally (1994) advised that the instruments be utilized in the current setting since they are reliable. It shows the chi-square values for all the hypotheses. For the first hypothesis, the value ( $\chi^2(10) = 56.303$ ;  $p < 0.05$ ) has a significant positive interaction with female teachers. Hence, female teachers are more beneficial for the primary schooling system. For the second hypothesis, the value of chi-square ( $\chi^2(1) = 71.441$ ;  $p < 0.05$ )

has positively significantly related to female teachers. Hence, female teachers are more committed to the teaching profession. For the third hypothesis, the value of chi-square ( $\chi^2(10) = 33.080$ ;  $p < 0.05$ ) indicates high job satisfaction among female teachers. As a result, in the teaching profession, there is a substantial correlation between job satisfaction and teacher gender.

## 5. Discussion

This study aimed to discover that which gender of teacher is more beneficial for primary students. Also, the impact of HR practices i.e., Job satisfaction on the commitment of teaching with a gender perspective. The first hypothesis predicted that female teachers are more beneficial for primary-level students because of their nurturing and caring nature. So, the hypothesis was verified. A very little amount of literature is presented on this relationship. Female teachers are a source of positive student learning outcomes and build a strong character of the student because of their nurturing nature as explained by previous studies. The second hypothesis forecasts that female teachers show high commitment to the teaching profession than male teachers because of its monotonous routine work. The results support this hypothesis. The findings were also in stark contrast to prior research, which claimed that gender does not affect a commitment to teaching (Moses et al., 2016). The third hypothesis anticipated that there is a significant relationship between job satisfaction and the gender of teachers in the teaching profession. The result showed that female teachers were more satisfied with the school job due to their mother role responsibility whereas, male teachers show dissatisfaction towards school job due to various reasons. However, the outcomes are consistent with earlier findings, indicating that female instructors are more satisfied with their jobs than male teachers in primary schools (Bogler, 2001).

## 6. Conclusion

Several studies in European and American countries have been undertaken to examine the impact of various HR practices on other characteristics such as performance, commitment to teaching, and so on. However, not much has been done in terms of Pakistan's perspectives. Future research should look into the various factors that influence HR practices and strategies, as well as the effective and efficient use of human capital, in order to improve learning outcomes and progress of primary children from a gender perspective. The standard of education in each country is directly connected to its progress. It is contingent on the commitment of teachers. Pakistan's educational infrastructure is in need of repair, and both instructors and students must commit to making rapid improvements. Because of its humble, caring, and understanding character toward children, the early stage of school life is the most crucial period of a child's foundation, and it necessitates a female teacher for the child's adjustment to the school environment. To strengthen the dedication, hard effort, and commitment of teachers, HR practices should be applied at the primary school level. Future studies examining gender commitment to the teaching profession should be undertaken on a large population base, with primary school teachers from various cities in Pakistan included.

## 7. Limitations and Suggestions

The study was restricted to a randomly selected sample of government and private sector schools from only one city, with less amount of data was collected from different districts of Karachi due to the lockdown of Covid-19. Consequently, the findings could not be predictive of the whole population. Secondly, the effect of only one variable was studied on the commitment to teaching which does not cover a complete variety of HR practices. Third, more HR practices with different variables would require in-depth study to form robust foundations of the education system in Pakistan.

## References

- Ashfaq, M. (2017, January 22). Only women teachers for primary schools proposed. *DAWN.COM*.
- Barney, J. B. (1991). *Firm resource and sustained competitive advantage*. *Journal of Management*, 17(1), 99-120. <https://doi.org/10.1177/014920639101700108>
- Barney, J., Wright, M., & Ketchen, D. J. Jr. (2001). *The Resource-based View of the Firm: Ten Years after 1991*. *J. Management*, 27, 625-641. <https://doi.org/10.1177/014920630102700601>
- Bhakuni, S., Kandari, S., & Gahlawat, C. (2020). Analysis of HRM Practices in Private Sector School Teachers in Uttarakhand. *Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences Studies*, 2(3), 86–89.
- Billingsley, B. S. (2004). Special Education Teacher Retention and Attrition: A critical analysis of the research literature. *The Journal of Special Education*, 38(1), 39–55. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00224669040380010401>
- Bogler, R. (2001). The Influence of Leadership Style on Teacher Job Satisfaction. *Educational Administration Quarterly*, 37(5), 662–683. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00131610121969460>
- Day, C., Elliot, B., & Kington, A. (2005). Reform, standards, and teacher identity: Challenges of sustaining commitment. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 21(5), 563–577. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2005.03.001>
- Drudy, S. (2008). Gender balance/gender bias: the teaching profession and the impact of feminisation. *Gender and Education*, 20(4), 309–323. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540250802190156>
- Fischman, G. E. (2007). Persistence and ruptures: the feminization of teaching and teacher education in Argentina. *Gender and Education*, 19(3), 353–368. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09540250701295502>
- Guarino, C. M., Santibañez, L., & Daley, G. A. (2006). Teacher Recruitment and Retention: A Review of the Recent Empirical Literature. *Review of Educational Research*, 76(2), 173–208. <https://doi.org/10.3102/00346543076002173>



- Hackett, R. D., Lapierre, L. M., & Hausdorf, P. A. (2001). Understanding the Links between Work Commitment Constructs. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 58(3), 392–413. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jvbe.2000.1776>
- Ingersoll, R. M., Peggy, R. M. I. N. A., Bobbitt, Q. S., Alsalam, N., Quinn, P., & Bobbitt, S. (1997). *Teacher professionalization and teacher commitment: A multilevel analysis*. Washington, DC: National Centre for Education Statistics.
- Kelleher, F. (2011). *Women and the teaching profession: Exploring the feminisation debate*. London: Commonwealth Secretariat and UNESCO.
- Kiran, S. (2019, February 8). *Underpaid and Overworked Teachers in Pakistan*. Diva Magazine.
- Klassen, R. M., & Chiu, M. M. (2011). *The occupational commitment and intention to quit of practicing and pre-service teachers: Influence of self-efficacy, job stress, and teaching context*. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 36(2), 114–129. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cedpsych.2011.01.002>
- Loeb, S., Kalogrides, D., & B éeille, T. (2012). Effective Schools: Teacher Hiring, Assignment, Development, and Retention. *Education Finance and Policy*, 7(3), 269–304. [https://doi.org/10.1162/EDFP\\_a\\_00068](https://doi.org/10.1162/EDFP_a_00068)
- Moses, I., Admiraal, W. F., & Berry, A. K. (2016). Gender and gender role differences in the student–teachers’ commitment to teaching. *Social Psychology of Education*, 19(3), 475–492. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11218-016-9340-3>
- Noddings, N. (2015). *The challenge to care in schools, 2nd Editon*. teachers’ college press.
- Nunnally, J. C. (1994). *Psychometric Theory 3E*. Tata McGraw-Hill education.
- Rani, R., & Rani, P. (2014). Influence of Organizational Climate of Elementary Schools on Job Satisfaction of Elementary Teachers. *International Journal of Science, Environment*, 3(2), 652–658.
- Reyes, P. (1990). *Teachers and Their Workplace: Commitment, Performance, and Productivity*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
- Rosenholtz, S. J. (1989). Workplace Conditions That Affect Teacher Quality and Commitment: Implications for Teacher Induction Programs. *The Elementary School Journal*, 89(4), 421–439. <https://doi.org/10.1086/461584>
- Rots, I., Aelterman, A., Devos, G., & Vlerick, P. (2010). Teacher education and the choice to enter the teaching profession: A prospective study. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 26(8), 1619–1629. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2010.06.013>
- Runhaar, P. (2016). How can schools and teachers benefit from human resources management? Conceptualising HRM from content and process perspectives. *Educational Management Administration & Leadership*, 45(4). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1741143215623786>

Sial, M., Jilani, S., Imran, R., & Zaheer, A. (2011). Effect of Human Resource Practices on Organizational Commitment in Pakistani Universities. *World Applied Science Journal*, 15(6), 793–798.

Tait, M. (2008). Resilience as a contributor to novice teacher success, commitment, and retention. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 35(4), 57–75.

Wright, P.M., B.B. Dunford, and S.A. Snell, 2001. *Human resources and the Resource-based view of the firm*. *J. Management*, 27, 701-721. <https://doi.org/10.1177/014920630102700607>

### Copyright Disclaimer

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).